

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, )  
 )  
 Plaintiff, )  
 ) C. A. No. \_\_\_\_\_  
 v. )  
 )  
 CAMILLE J. AMATO, )  
 THOMAS AMATO, )  
 PENN YAN BOAT COMPANY LLC, )  
 PENN YAN MARINE )  
 MANUFACTURING CORP., )  
 CAMILLE PROPERTIES, INC., )  
 and YATES COUNTY, )  
 )  
 Defendants. )  
\_\_\_\_\_ )

**PARTIAL CONSENT DECREE**

**I. BACKGROUND**

A. The United States of America (“United States”), on behalf of the Administrator of the United States Environmental Protection Agency (“EPA”), filed a complaint in this matter pursuant to Section 107 of the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, 42 U.S.C. § 9607, as amended (“CERCLA”), seeking reimbursement of response costs incurred for response actions taken at or in connection with the release or threatened release of hazardous substances at the Penn Yan Superfund Site located at 15 Waddell Avenue, in Penn Yan, Yates County, New York (“Site”).

B. By entering into this consent decree (“Consent Decree”), Defendant Yates County (“Settling Defendant”) does not admit any liability to Plaintiff arising out of the transactions or occurrences alleged in the complaint.

C. The United States and Settling Defendant agree, and this Court by entering this Consent Decree finds, that this Consent Decree has been negotiated by the Parties in good faith, that settlement of this matter will avoid prolonged and complicated litigation between the Parties, and that this Consent Decree is fair, reasonable, and in the public interest.

THEREFORE, with the consent of the Parties to this Decree, it is ORDERED, ADJUDGED, AND DECREED:

## **II. JURISDICTION**

1. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this action pursuant to 28 U.S.C. §§ 1331 and 1345 and 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613(b) and also has personal jurisdiction over Settling Defendant. Solely for the purposes of this Consent Decree and the underlying complaint, Settling Defendant waives all objections and defenses that it may have to the jurisdiction of the Court or to venue in this District. Settling Defendant consents to and shall not challenge entry of this Consent Decree or this Court's jurisdiction to enter and enforce this Consent Decree.

## **III. PARTIES BOUND**

2. This Consent Decree is binding upon the United States, and upon Settling Defendant and its heirs, successors and assigns. Any change in ownership or corporate or other legal status, including, but not limited to, any transfer of assets or real or personal property, shall in no way alter the status or responsibilities of Settling Defendant under this Consent Decree.

## **IV. DEFINITIONS**

3. Unless otherwise expressly provided herein, terms used in this Consent Decree which are defined in CERCLA or in regulations promulgated under CERCLA shall have the meaning assigned to them in CERCLA or in such regulations. Whenever terms listed below are used in this Consent Decree or in any appendix attached hereto, the following definitions shall apply:

a. "CERCLA" shall mean the Comprehensive Environmental Response, Compensation, and Liability Act of 1980, as amended, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9601-9675.

b. "Consent Decree" shall mean this Consent Decree and all appendices attached hereto. In the event of conflict between this Consent Decree and any appendix, this Consent Decree shall control.

c. The term "day" shall mean a calendar day. In computing any period of time under this Consent Decree, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, or federal holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.

d. "DOJ" shall mean the United States Department of Justice and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.

e. "EPA" shall mean the United States Environmental Protection Agency and any successor departments, agencies or instrumentalities of the United States.

f. "EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund" shall mean the Hazardous Substance Superfund established by the Internal Revenue Code, 26 U.S.C. § 9507.

g. "Interest" shall mean interest at the rate specified for interest on investments of the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund established by 26 U.S.C. § 9507, compounded annually on October 1 of each year, in accordance with 42 U.S.C. § 9607(a). The applicable rate of interest shall be the rate in effect at the time the interest accrues. The rate of interest is subject to change on October 1 of each year.

h. "Paragraph" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by an Arabic numeral or an upper or lower case letter.

I. "Party" or "Parties" shall mean the United States and/or the Settling Defendant.

j. "Past Response Costs" shall mean all costs, including but not limited to direct and indirect costs, that EPA or DOJ on behalf of EPA has paid at or in connection with the Site through the Effective Date of this Consent Decree, plus accrued Interest on all such costs through such date.

k. "Plaintiff" shall mean the United States.

l. "RCRA" shall mean the Solid Waste Disposal Act, 42 U.S.C. § 6901, *et seq.* (also known as the Resource Conservation and Recovery Act).

m. "Section" shall mean a portion of this Consent Decree identified by a Roman numeral.

n. "Settling Defendant" shall mean Yates County.

o. "Site" shall mean the Penn Yan Superfund Site, encompassing approximately 14.5 acres, located at 15 Waddell Avenue, in Penn Yan, Yates County, New York.

p. "United States" shall mean the United States of America, including its departments, agencies and instrumentalities.

#### **V. STATEMENT OF PURPOSE**

4. By entering into this Consent Decree, the mutual objective of the Parties is for Settling Defendant to make a cash payment to address its liability for the Site as provided in the Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff in Section VIII, and subject to the Reservations of Rights by United States in Section IX.

#### **VI. PAYMENT OF RESPONSE COSTS**

5. Settling Defendant shall pay to the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund the principal sum of \$275,000, plus an additional sum for Interest as set forth below. Payment shall be made

in two installments. The second installment shall include the principal amount due plus an additional sum for accrued Interest on the declining principal balance calculated from the date of entry of this Consent Decree. The first payment of \$137,500 shall be due within 60 days of entry of this Consent Decree. One subsequent payment of \$137,500 plus Interest shall be due on the first anniversary of the date of entry of this Consent Decree. Settling Defendant may accelerate the second payment, and Interest due shall be reduced accordingly.

6. Payments shall be made by FedWire Electronic Funds Transfer (“EFT”) to the U.S. Department of Justice account in accordance with current EFT procedures, referencing USAO File Number 07V1413, the EPA Region and Site Spill ID Number 02-TE, and DOJ Case Number 90-11-3-09115. Payments shall be made in accordance with instructions provided to Settling Defendant by the Financial Litigation Unit of the U.S. Attorney’s Office in the Western District of New York following lodging of the Consent Decree. Any payment received by the Department of Justice after 4:00 p.m. Eastern Time shall be credited on the next business day.

7. At the time of each payment, Settling Defendant shall send notice that payment has been made to EPA and DOJ in accordance with Section XIII (Notices and Submissions).

8. The total amount of each payment to be paid pursuant to Paragraph 5 shall be deposited in the EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund.

## **VII. FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH CONSENT DECREE**

9. Interest on Late Payments. If Settling Defendant fails to make any payment under Paragraph 5 by the required due date, all remaining installment payments and all accrued Interest shall become due immediately upon such failure. Interest shall continue to accrue on any unpaid amounts until the total amount due has been received.

### **10. Stipulated Penalty.**

a. If any amounts due under Paragraph 5 are not paid by the required date, Settling Defendant shall be in violation of this Consent Decree and shall be required to pay, as a stipulated penalty, in addition to the Interest required by Paragraph 9, \$500 per violation per day that such payment is late.

b. Stipulated penalties are due and payable within 30 days of the date of the demand for payment of the penalties by EPA. All payments to EPA under this Paragraph shall be identified as “stipulated penalties” and shall be made by certified or cashier’s check made payable to “EPA Hazardous Substance Superfund.” The check, or a letter accompanying the check, shall reference the name and address of the party making payment, the Site name, the EPA Region and Site Spill ID Number 02-TE, and DOJ Case Number 90-11-3-09115, and shall be sent to:

US Environmental Protection Agency

Superfund Payments  
Cincinnati Finance Center  
PO Box 979076  
St. Louis, MO 63197-9000

c. At the time of each payment, Settling Defendant shall send notice that payment has been made to:

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Cincinnati Finance Office  
26 Martin Luther King Drive  
Cincinnati, OH 45268

In addition, Settling Defendant shall send notice that payment has been made to EPA and DOJ in accordance with Section XIII (Notices and Submissions).

d. Penalties shall accrue as provided in this Paragraph regardless of whether EPA has notified Settling Defendant of the violation or made a demand for payment, but need only be paid upon demand. All penalties shall begin to accrue on the day after payment is due and shall continue to accrue through the date of payment. Nothing herein shall prevent the simultaneous accrual of separate penalties for separate violations of this Consent Decree.

11. If the United States brings an action to enforce this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall reimburse the United States for all costs of such action, including but not limited to costs of attorney time.

12. Payments made under this Section shall be in addition to any other remedies or sanctions available to Plaintiff by virtue of Settling Defendant's failure to comply with the requirements of this Consent Decree.

13. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Section, the United States may, in its unreviewable discretion, waive payment of any portion of the stipulated penalties that have accrued pursuant to this Consent Decree. Payment of stipulated penalties shall not excuse Settling Defendant's from payment as required by Section VI or from performance of any other requirements of this Consent Decree.

#### **VIII. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY PLAINTIFF**

14. Except as specifically provided in Section IX (Reservation of Rights by United States), the United States covenants not to sue or to take administrative action against Settling Defendant pursuant to Sections 106 and 107(a) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606 and 9607(a), to recover Past Response Costs. This covenant not to sue shall take effect upon receipt by EPA of the first payment required by Section VI, Paragraph 5 (Reimbursement of Response Costs). This covenant not to sue is conditioned upon the satisfactory performance by Settling Defendant of its

obligations under this Consent Decree, including but not limited to, payment of all amounts due under Section VI (Payment of Response Costs), and any amount due under Section VII (Failure to Comply with Consent Decree). This covenant not to sue extends only to Settling Defendant and does not extend to any other person.

#### **IX. RESERVATION OF RIGHTS BY UNITED STATES**

15. The United States reserves, and this Consent Decree is without prejudice to, all rights against Settling Defendant with respect to all matters not expressly included within the Covenant Not to Sue by United States in Paragraph 14. Notwithstanding any other provision of this Consent Decree, the United States reserves all rights against Settling Defendant with respect to:

- a. liability for failure of Settling Defendant to meet a requirement of this Consent Decree;
- b. criminal liability;
- c. liability for damages for injury to, destruction of, or loss of natural resources, and for the costs of any natural resource damage assessments;
- d. liability, based upon Settling Defendant's ownership or operation of the Site, or upon Settling Defendant's transportation, treatment, storage, or disposal, or the arrangement for the transportation, treatment, storage, or disposal, of a hazardous substance or a solid waste at or in connection with the Site, after signature of this Consent Decree by Settling Defendant; and
- e. liability arising from the past, present, or future disposal, release or threat of release of a hazardous substance, pollutant, or contaminant outside of the Site.

#### **X. COVENANT NOT TO SUE BY SETTLING DEFENDANT**

17. Settling Defendant covenants not to sue and agrees not to assert any claims or causes of action against the United States, or its contractors or employees, with respect to the Site or this Consent Decree, including but not limited to:

- a. any direct or indirect claim for reimbursement from the Hazardous Substance Superfund based on Sections 106(b)(2), 107, 111, 112, or 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9606(b)(2), 9607, 9611, 9612, or 9613, or any other provision of law;
- b. any claim arising out of response actions at or in connection with the Site, including any claim under the United States Constitution, the Tucker Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1491, the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, as amended, or at common law; or
- c. any claim against the United States pursuant to Sections 107 and 113 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9607 and 9613, relating to the Site.

18. Nothing in this Consent Decree shall be deemed to constitute approval or preauthorization of a claim within the meaning of Section 111 of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9611, or 40 C.F.R. 300.700(d).

19. Settling Defendant agrees not to assert any CERCLA claims or causes of action to recover Past Response Costs, including for contribution, against any other person unless such person asserts a claim or cause of action to recover Past Response Costs against Settling Defendant.

#### **XI. EFFECT OF SETTLEMENT/CONTRIBUTION PROTECTION**

20. Except as provided in Paragraph 19, nothing in this Consent Decree shall be construed to create any rights in, or grant any cause of action to, any person not a Party to this Consent Decree. The preceding sentence shall not be construed to waive or nullify any rights that any person not a signatory to this Decree may have under applicable law. Except as provided in Paragraph 19, the Parties expressly reserve any and all rights (including, but not limited to, any right to contribution), defenses, claims, demands, and causes of action which they may have with respect to any matter, transaction, or occurrence relating in any way to the Site against any person not a Party hereto.

21. The Parties agree, and by entering this Consent Decree this Court finds, that Settling Defendant is entitled, as of the date of entry of this Consent Decree, to protection from contribution actions or claims as provided by Section 113(f)(2) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. § 9613(f)(2), for “matters addressed” in this Consent Decree. The “matters addressed” in this Consent Decree are Past Response Costs.

22. Settling Defendant agrees that, with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought by it for matters related to this Consent Decree, it will notify EPA and DOJ in writing no later than 60 days prior to the initiation of such suit or claim. Settling Defendant also agrees that, with respect to any suit or claim for contribution brought against it for matters related to this Consent Decree, it will notify EPA and DOJ in writing within 10 days of service of the complaint or claim upon it. In addition, Settling Defendant shall notify EPA and DOJ within 10 days of service or receipt of any Motion for Summary Judgment, and within 10 days of receipt of any order from a court setting a case for trial, for matters related to this Consent Decree.

23. The covenants not to sue by Settling Defendant set forth in paragraph 17 shall not apply in the event the United States brings a cause of action or issues an order pursuant to the reservations set forth in Paragraph 16 (c) - (e), but only to the extent that Settling Defendant’s claims arise from the same response action or response costs that the United States is seeking pursuant to the applicable reservation. However, in any subsequent administrative or judicial proceeding initiated by the United States for injunctive relief, recovery of response costs, or other relief relating to the Site, Settling Defendant shall not assert, and may not maintain, any defense or claim based upon the principles of waiver, *res judicata*, collateral estoppel, issue preclusion, claim-splitting, or other defenses based upon any contention that the claims raised by

the United States in the subsequent proceeding were or should have been brought in the instant case; provided, however, that nothing in this Paragraph affects the enforceability of the Covenant Not to Sue by Plaintiff set forth in Section VIII.

## **XII. RETENTION OF RECORDS**

24. Until 10 years after the entry of this Consent Decree, Settling Defendant shall preserve and retain all records now in their possession or control, or which come into their possession or control, that relate in any manner to response actions taken at the Site or the liability of any person under CERCLA with respect to the Site, regardless of any corporate retention policy to the contrary.

25. After the conclusion of the document retention period in the preceding paragraph, Settling Defendant shall notify EPA and DOJ at least 90 days prior to the destruction of any such records, and, upon request by EPA or DOJ, Settling Defendant shall deliver any such records to EPA. Settling Defendants may assert that certain records are privileged under the attorney-client privilege or any other privilege recognized by federal law. If Settling Defendant asserts such a privilege, it shall provide Plaintiff with the following: 1) the title of the record; 2) the date of the record; 3) the name and title of the author of the record; 4) the name and title of each addressee and recipient; 5) a description of the subject of the record; and 6) the privilege asserted. If a claim of privilege applies only to a portion of a record, the record shall be provided to EPA in redacted form to mask the privileged information only. Settling Defendant shall retain all records that it claims to be privileged until the United States has had a reasonable opportunity to dispute the privilege claim and any such dispute has been resolved in the Settling Defendant's favor. However, no records created or generated pursuant to the requirements of this or any other settlement with the United States shall be withheld on the grounds that they are privileged.

26. Settling Defendant hereby certifies that, to the best of its knowledge and belief, after thorough inquiry, it has not altered, mutilated, discarded, destroyed or otherwise disposed of any records, reports, or other information relating to their potential liability regarding the Site since notification of potential liability by the United States or the State or the filing of suit against it regarding the Site, and that they have fully complied with any and all EPA requests for information regarding the Site and Settling Defendant's financial circumstances pursuant to Sections 104(e) and 122(e) of CERCLA, 42 U.S.C. §§ 9604(e) and 9622(e), and Section 3007 of RCRA, 42 U.S.C. § 6927; and

## **XIII. NOTICES AND SUBMISSIONS**

27. Whenever, under the terms of this Consent Decree, notice is required to be given or a document is required to be sent by one party to another, it shall be directed to the individuals at the addresses specified below, unless those individuals or their successors give notice of a change to the other Parties in writing. Written notice as specified herein shall constitute complete satisfaction of any written notice requirement of the Consent Decree with respect to the United States, EPA, DOJ, and Settling Defendant, respectively.



As to the United States:

As to DOJ:

Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
U.S. Department of Justice (DJ # 90-11-3-09115)  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, D.C. 20044-7611

As to EPA:

Henry Guzmán  
New York/Caribbean Superfund Branch  
Office of Regional Counsel  
United States Environmental Protection Agency Region 2  
290 Broadway, 17th Floor  
New York, NY 10007

As to Settling Defendant:

County Administrator  
Yates County  
417 Liberty Street  
Penn Yan, NY 14527

With copies to:

Terry Richman, Esq.  
Underberg & Kessler LLP  
300 Bausch & Lomb Place  
Rochester, NY 14604

**XIV. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION**

28. This Court shall retain jurisdiction over this matter for the purpose of interpreting and enforcing the terms of this Consent Decree.

**XV. INTEGRATION/APPENDICES**

29. This Consent Decree constitutes the final, complete and exclusive Consent Decree and understanding between the Parties with respect to the settlement embodied in this Consent Decree. The Parties acknowledge that there are no representations, agreements or understandings relating to the settlement other than those expressly contained in this Consent Decree.

**XVI. LODGING AND OPPORTUNITY FOR PUBLIC COMMENT**

30. This Consent Decree shall be lodged with the Court for a period of not less than 30 days for public notice and comment. The United States reserves the right to withdraw or withhold its consent if the comments regarding the Consent Decree disclose facts or considerations which indicate that this Consent Decree is inappropriate, improper, or inadequate. Settling Defendant consents to the entry of this Consent Decree without further notice.

31. If for any reason this Court should decline to approve this Consent Decree in the form presented, this Consent Decree is voidable at the sole discretion of any party and the terms of the Consent Decree may not be used as evidence in any litigation between the Parties.

#### **XVII. SIGNATORIES/SERVICE**

32. The undersigned representative of Settling Defendant to this Consent Decree and the Deputy Chief, Environmental Enforcement Section of the United States Department of Justice, certifies that he or she is authorized to enter into the terms and conditions of this Consent Decree and to execute and bind legally such Party to this document.

33. Settling Defendant hereby agrees not to oppose entry of this Consent Decree by this Court or to challenge any provision of this Consent Decree unless the United States has notified Settling Defendant in writing that it no longer supports entry of the Consent Decree.

34. Settling Defendant shall identify, on the attached signature page, the name and address of an agent who is authorized to accept service of process by mail on its behalf with respect to all matters arising under or relating to this Consent Decree. Settling Defendant hereby agrees to accept service in that manner and to waive the formal service requirements set forth in Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and any applicable local rules of this Court, including but not limited to service of a summons. The Parties agree that Settling Defendant need not file an answer to the complaint in this action unless or until the Court expressly declines to enter this Consent Decree.

#### **XVIII. FINAL JUDGMENT**

35. Upon approval and entry of this Consent Decree by the Court, this Consent Decree shall constitute the final judgment between and among the United States and Settling Defendant. The Court finds that there is no just reason for delay and therefore enters this judgment as a final judgment under Fed. R. Civ. P. 54 and 58.

SO ORDERED THIS \_\_\_\_ DAY OF \_\_\_\_\_, 2008.

\_\_\_\_\_  
United States District Judge

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTIES enter into this Consent Decree in the matter of United States v. Camille Amato, Thomas Amato and Yates County, C.A. No. \_\_\_\_\_, relating to the Penn Yan Superfund Site.

FOR THE UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

RONALD J. TENPAS  
Assistant Attorney General  
Environment and Natural Resources Division

---

BRUCE GELBER  
Chief  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
Environment and Natural Resources Division

---

MARCELLO MOLLO  
Trial Attorney  
Environmental Enforcement Section  
Environment and Natural Resources Division  
United States Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7611  
Washington, D.C. 20044-7611  
(202) 514-2757

TERRANCE P. FLYNN  
United States Attorney  
Western District of New York

Christopher V. Taffe  
Assistant United States Attorney  
Western District of New York  
U.S. Courthouse  
100 State Street  
Rochester, NY 14614  
(585) 263-6760

FOR EPA:

---

GEORGE PAVLOU  
Acting Division Director  
Emergency and Remedial Response Division  
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
290 Broadway  
New York, New York 10007-1866

THE UNDERSIGNED PARTY enters into this Consent Decree in the matter of United States v. Camille Amato, Thomas Amato and Yates County, C.A. No. \_\_\_\_\_, relating to the Penn Yan Superfund Site.

FOR DEFENDANT YATES COUNTY

Date: 7/17/08

\_\_\_\_\_  
Name: Robert N. Multer  
Title: Legislature Chairman  
Address: 417 Liberty Street  
Penn Yan, NY 14527

Agent Authorized to Accept Service on Behalf of Yates County:

Terry Richman, Esq.  
Underberg & Kessler LLP  
300 Bausch & Lomb Place  
Rochester, NY 14604